

From: Patrick Frank pfrank@slac.stanford.edu
Subject: Re: EARTH2780
Date: August 19, 2015 at 10:22 AM
To: Earth-Science Reviews earth-eo@elsevier.com
Cc: pfrank830@earthlink.net, D.Lovegrove@elsevier.com

PF

Dear Dr. Horscroft,

As you know, the prior manuscript received one positive review and one negative review.

I showed negative review #1 to be grossly incompetent. The decision to reject therefore clearly followed editor Tim Li's profound conflict of interest.

Your characterization that the manuscript was "declined based on the reviews" is thus a misrepresentation.

It is also very difficult to believe that two experimental physicists cannot be found to act as reviewers.

The analysis presented in the manuscript is clearly correct. It is perhaps the most acute critical analysis of GCM reliability in at least 25 years.

Typically, a journal will welcome a novel critical analysis. And yet everywhere thus far, now including ESR, every excuse has been taken to decline or reject.

Apart from the intervention of Mr. Lovegrove, the received process at ESR does not at all reflect well on the journal.

Thank-you for your consideration.

Yours sincerely,

Pat Frank

On 8/19/15 3:36 AM, Earth-Science Reviews wrote:

Dear Dr Frank

Thank you again for your submission. You will recall the previous version under number EARTH2700 that was declined based on the reviews. The new version has received an entirely new editorial handling but regrettably, after many conciliatory attempts we were not able to find referees who wish to engage with the ms. Thus, and in the interests of not holding up your efforts to get this published, we are returning it so you can find a more suitable venue within the climate sciences literature.

With our best wishes for finding a suitable outlet.

Regards, Tim

Tim Horscroft

Review Papers Coordinator

<http://www.journals.elsevier.com/earth-science-reviews>

--

Patrick Frank
Stanford Synchrotron Radiation Lightsource
SLAC
Stanford University

Tel: +1-650-723-2479
email: pfrank@slac.stanford.edu
