

**From:** Patrick Frank pfrank830@earthlink.net  
**Subject:** Re: gmd-2017-281 (author) - manuscript not accepted  
**Date:** November 7, 2017 at 7:46 PM  
**To:** editorial@copernicus.org  
**Cc:** jules@blueskiesresearch.org.uk

PF

Dear Ms. Töpfer,

Dr. Annan has a vested economic interest in climate modeling. He does not qualify as editor under the ethical conflict of interest guidelines of the Journal.

Dr. Annan's posted appraisal is factually, indeed fatally, incorrect.

Dr. Annan wrongly claimed the  $\pm 4 \text{ W/m}^2$  annual error is explained "nowhere in the manuscript." It is explained on page 30, lines 571-584.

The full derivation is provided in Supporting Information Section 6.2.

There is no doubt that the  $\pm 4 \text{ W/m}^2$  is an annual calibration uncertainty.

One can only surmise that Dr. Annan did not read the manuscript before coming to his decision.

Dr. Annan also made the naïve error of supposing that the  $\pm 4 \text{ W/m}^2$  calibration uncertainty is a constant offset physical error.

Plus/minus cannot be constant positive (or negative). It cannot be subtracted away in an anomaly.

Dr. Annan's rejection is not only scientifically unjustifiable. It is not even scientific.

I ask that Dr. Annan be excused on ethical grounds, and on the grounds of an obviously careless and truly incompetent initial appraisal.

I further respectfully ask that the manuscript be reinstated and re-assigned to an alternative editor who is capable of non-partisan stewardship.

Thank-you for your consideration,

Pat

Patrick Frank, Ph.D.  
Palo Alto, CA 94301  
email: pfrank830@earthlink.net  
++++  
These things are, we conjecture, like the truth;  
But as for certain truth, no one has known it.

Xenophanes, 570-500 BCE  
++++

On Nov 7, 2017, at 6:07 AM, editorial@copernicus.org wrote:

Dear Patrick Frank,

We regret that your following submission was not accepted for publication in GMD:

Title: Propagation of Error and the Reliability of Global Air Temperature Projections  
Author(s): Patrick Frank  
MS No.: gmd-2017-281  
MS Type: Methods for assessment of models  
Iteration: Initial Submission

You can view the reasons for this decision via your MS Overview: [http://editor.copernicus.org/GMD/my\\_manuscript\\_overview](http://editor.copernicus.org/GMD/my_manuscript_overview)

To log in, please use your Copernicus Office user ID 421670.

We thank you very much for your understanding and hope that you will consider GMD again for the publication of your future scientific papers.

In case any questions arise, please contact me.

Kind regards,

Natascha Töpfer  
Copernicus Publications  
Editorial Support  
[editorial@copernicus.org](mailto:editorial@copernicus.org)

on behalf of the GMD Editorial Board