

From: jgr-atmospheres@agu.org
Date: October 8, 2013 12:39:00 PM PDT
To: pfrank830@earthlink.net
Subject: 2013JD020840 (Editor - Steven Ghan): Decision Letter
Reply-To: jgr-atmospheres@agu.org

Dear Dr. Frank:

Thank you for submitting your manuscript for publication in Journal of Geophysical Research - Atmospheres. I have now received 2 reviews of your manuscript. It has been examined by expert reviewers whose comments are enclosed. The reviewers have expressed serious reservations about this work that I do not believe could be addressed through a standard major revision. In light of the comments received, I am unable to accept the manuscript for publication in Journal of Geophysical Research - Atmospheres.

I am enclosing the reviews, which you may find helpful if you decide to revise your manuscript and submit to another journal. I am sorry that I cannot be more encouraging at this time.

Thank you for your interest in JGR- Atmospheres.

Sincerely,

Steve Ghan
Editor-in-Chief, JGR-Atmospheres
+++++

From: Patrick Frank <pfrank830@earthlink.net>
Date: October 8, 2013 7:58:37 PM PDT
To: jgr-atmospheres@agu.org
Subject: Re: 2013JD020840 (Editor - Steven Ghan): Decision Letter

Dear Dr. Ghan,

Thank-you for your kind reply. Negative reviews were not unexpected. however I believe an effective response is possible.

For example, it is apparent that reviewer #1 did not consult the Auxiliary Material demonstrating the validity of the linear model before making a judgment about it.

I will appreciate an opportunity to reply.

Thank-you for your consideration,

Pat

Patrick Frank
Palo Alto, CA 94301

email: pfrank830@earthlink.net

+++++

From: jgr-atmospheres <jgr-atmospheres@agu.org>

Date: October 11, 2013 11:53:11 AM PDT

To: Patrick Frank <pfrank830@earthlink.net>

Subject: RE: 2013JD020840 (Editor - Steven Ghan): Decision Letter

Dear Dr. Frank,

Please see the response below from Dr. Ghan:

There is some interesting work in there, but the estimate of the uncertainty in the cloud forcing is completely wrong and must be removed in any resubmission.

Steve Ghan