

Subject: Case 05876565 PONE-D-18-14400
From: Patrick Frank <pfrank@slac.stanford.edu>
Date: 8/12/18, 4:01 PM
To: jheber@plos.org, PLOS ONE <plosone@plos.org>

Dear Dr. Heber,

Thank-you for providing the PLoS One avenue of appeal.

Please find attached the in-filled PLoS Appeal Request form as well as my point-by-point response to the Editorial review.

The formal appeal rests upon Academic Editor Dr. Añel's profound conflict of interest with a manuscript study that negatively impacts his own professional work.

Regarding his review, Dr. Añel never addressed the core of the study: that global air temperature projections are linear extrapolations of GHG forcing and the logical entrainment of propagated calibration error.

He never addressed the obvious truth that GCMs cannot resolve a perturbation (CO2 forcing) 114-fold below their lower limit of resolution.

The point-by-point response finally shows that Dr. Añel's review lacked substantive content and was dismissive rather than critical.

My original cover letter asked that the reviewers not include climate modelers for the intrinsic reason of deep professional conflict and the evidenced reason of non-expertise in physical error analysis. I believe that case to now be made.

I ask only for a fair and knowledgeable review. The point-by-point shows that neither was in view here.

The linearity of GCM air temperature projections is fully demonstrated and the propagation of GCM thermal flux error is correctly done.

I seek a journal editor with the courage of a scientist; willing to publish an obviously correct study in the face of intense political opposition.

A good scientific argument provides an invulnerable bulwark against criticism. One need only require critics to point out an error (that does not exist).

Yours sincerely,

Pat

Patrick Frank, Ph.D.
Stanford Synchrotron Radiation Lightsource
SLAC
Stanford University

Tel: +1-650-723-2479

email: pfrank@slac.stanford.edu

— Attachments: —	
Frank_response_PONE-D-18-14400.pdf	1.4 MB
PLOS ONE Appeal Request_Frank_D-18-14400.docx	19.6 KB